

Vikas Srivastava · Shakti Mehrotra
Sonal Mishra *Editors*

Hairy Roots

An Effective Tool of Plant Biotechnology

Editors

Vikas Srivastava
Department of Botany
Central University of Jammu
Samba, Jammu and Kashmir, India

Shakti Mehrotra
Plant Biotechnology Division
CSIR-Central Institute of Medicinal
and Aromatic Plants
Lucknow, Uttar Pradesh, India

Sonal Mishra
School of Biotechnology
University of Jammu
Jammu, Jammu and Kashmir, India

ISBN 978-981-13-2561-8 ISBN 978-981-13-2562-5 (eBook)
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-13-2562-5>

Library of Congress Control Number: 2018961385

© Springer Nature Singapore Pte Ltd. 2018

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

This Springer imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Singapore Pte Ltd.
The registered company address is: 152 Beach Road, #21-01/04 Gateway East, Singapore 189721, Singapore

Chapter 12

Hairy Roots as a Tool for the Functional Analysis of Plant Genes



Chonglu Zhong, Mathish Nambiar-Veetil, Didier Bogusz,
and Claudine Franche

Abstract With its root-inducing (Ri) plasmid, *Agrobacterium rhizogenes* is a valuable alternative to transfer gene constructs into the genome of plant species which are difficult to stably transform with disarmed strains of *Agrobacterium tumefaciens*. Composite plants consisting of transformed hairy roots induced on a non-transgenic shoot have been reported in an increasing number of legume and nonlegume plant species. They were first used in the model legumes *Medicago truncatula* and *Lotus japonicus* to study the symbiotic interaction with rhizobia. Since then, composite plants have been shown to be effective to investigate the function of genes involved in mycorrhizal symbiosis, root-nematode and root-pathogen interactions, resistance response of plant roots to parasitic weeds, root development and branching, and the formation of wood. The different methodologies developed to generate composite plants and the applications of co-transformed hairy roots for studying gene function are discussed in this chapter, together with recent opportunities offered by genome editing technologies in hairy roots.

Keywords *Agrobacterium rhizogenes* · Composite plant · Gene functional analysis · Genome editing · Hairy root

C. Zhong

Research Institute of Tropical Forestry, Chinese Academy of Forestry, Guangzhou, People's Republic of China

e-mail: zcl@ritf.ac.cn

M. Nambiar-Veetil

Division of Plant Biotechnology, Institute of Forest Genetics and Tree Breeding, Coimbatore, India

D. Bogusz · C. Franche (✉)

UMR DIADE, Institut de Recherche pour le Développement (IRD), Montpellier, France

e-mail: didier.bogusz@ird.fr; claudine.franche@ird.fr

12.1 Introduction

Once a gene has been isolated, the exploration of its function begins with DNA sequence analysis together with a search of public databases for characterized genes with similar sequences. However, such a comparison involves certain risks since similarity at the nucleotide level does not always mean the gene product will have a similar structure and function. Additional information can be obtained by analyzing the spatiotemporal expression of the studied gene and its response to several biotic and abiotic factors. Nevertheless, one of the most significant steps in the functional analysis usually involves the study of transgenic plants in which the gene has been knocked out by mutagenesis, overexpressed, or downregulated (Rhee and Mutwil 2014). With the alterations observed in the plant phenotype, important conclusions can be drawn concerning the function of the corresponding gene.

Agrobacterium tumefaciens-mediated transformation is the most popular technique to generate transgenic plants. However, a major problem linked to the use of this bacterium is the need for efficient organ regeneration and transformation in plants (Anami et al. 2013). To study genes expressed in plant roots, *Agrobacterium rhizogenes* offers a valuable alternative to disarmed strains of *A. tumefaciens*. This gram-negative soil bacterium is responsible for the development of hairy root disease in many dicotyledonous plants as well as in some gymnosperms and monocotyledonous plants (Tepfer 1990). In a process similar to that described for *A. tumefaciens*, *A. rhizogenes* transfer into the genome of the infected host plant a T-DNA fragment from the bacterial root-inducing (Ri) plasmid carrying oncogenes that encode enzymes which control auxin and cytokinin biosynthesis (Koplow et al. 1984; Britton et al. 2008). The resulting modifications in the hormonal balance induce the formation of roots at the wounding site which are morphologically different from normal roots. The so-called hairy roots are characterized by rapid hormone-independent growth, are much more branched, have numerous root hairs, and exhibit plagiotropic root development. *A. rhizogenes* has proven to be a valuable tool for generating transgenic roots which are easy to grow and can be used for a range of biological applications including metabolic engineering and phytoremediation, as well as for the production of valuable secondary metabolites and recombinant proteins (Guillon et al. 2006; Talano et al. 2012; Mehrotra et al. 2015).

A. rhizogenes hairy roots have other valuable applications in many areas of basic plant research. This pathogenic bacterium can be used to generate composite plants consisting of transformed hairy roots induced on a non-transgenic shoot (Beach and Gresshoff 1988; Hansen et al. 1989; Collier et al. 2005). Binary vectors carrying appropriate gene constructs can be introduced into oncogenic strains of *A. rhizogenes*; the resulting bacteria can then be used to obtain co-transformed hairy roots which integrate both the T-DNA from the Ri plasmid and the T-DNA from the genetically engineered binary vector. The co-transformation procedure enables more rapid analysis of transformed roots than the methods used to generate plants which are stably transformed by disarmed *A. tumefaciens* or by direct gene

Table 12.1 Composite plant-inducible families and species

Family	Genus/species
Apiaceae	<i>Daucus carota</i>
Brassicaceae	<i>Arabidopsis thaliana</i> <i>Brassica oleracea</i>
Casuarinaceae	<i>Allocasuarina verticillata</i> <i>Casuarina glauca</i>
Chenopodiaceae	<i>Beta vulgaris</i>
Convolvulaceae	<i>Ipomoea batatas</i>
Cucurbitaceae	<i>Cucurbita pepo</i>
Datisceae	<i>Datisca glomerata</i>
Fabaceae	<i>Aeschynomene indica</i> <i>Arachis hypogaea</i> <i>Glycine max</i> <i>Lotus corniculatus</i> <i>Lotus japonicus</i> <i>Lupinus albus</i> <i>Medicago truncatula</i> <i>Phaseolus vulgaris</i> <i>Pisum sativum</i> <i>Sesbania rostrata</i> <i>Trifolium pratense</i> <i>Trifolium rubens</i> <i>Vicia hirsuta</i> <i>Vigna aconitifolia</i> <i>Vigna unguiculata</i>
Lauraceae	<i>Persea americana</i>
Malvaceae	<i>Hibiscus esculenta</i>
Myrtaceae	<i>Eucalyptus camaldulensis</i> <i>Eucalyptus grandis</i>
Poaceae	<i>Zea mays</i>
Rhamnaceae	<i>Discaria trinervis</i>
Rosaceae	<i>Prunus</i> spp.
Rubiaceae	<i>Coffea arabica</i>
Salicaceae	<i>Populus</i> sp.
Solanaceae	<i>Lycopersicon esculentum</i> <i>Nicotiana benthamiana</i> <i>Nicotiana tabacum</i> <i>Petunia x hybrida</i> <i>Solanum tuberosum</i>
Theaceae	<i>Camellia sinensis</i>

Adapted from Collier et al. (2005) and completed with recent references

transfer techniques, such as biolistic or protoplast electroporation. Composite plants have now been reported in at least 18 plant families including about 40 species (Table 12.1), and the utility of the co-transformed hairy roots for investigating the function of genes involved in different aspects of root development and biotic interactions is now well established.

Different methods to generate composite plants using *A. rhizogenes* are described in this chapter, and their contribution to the functional analysis of candidate genes involved in different physiological processes is illustrated. In addition to promoter studies and downregulation of gene expression resulting from RNA interference (RNAi) experiments, the recent development of genomic mutations induced by the CRISPR (clustered regularly interspaced short palindromic repeats)/Cas9 (CRISPR-associated protein 9) system in composite plants is presented.

12.2 *Agrobacterium Rhizogenes*-Mediated Transformation: Technical Aspects

12.2.1 *Factors Involved in a Successful T-DNA Transfer by A. rhizogenes*

A successful transfer of a T-DNA into a plant species involves many factors that need to be optimized, especially when the host is poorly susceptible to agrobacterial infection. Fortunately, knowledge of the molecular mechanisms underlying the interaction between plants and agrobacteria has progressed remarkably in recent years, making it possible to genetically transform an increasing number of plant species (Lacroix and Citovsky 2013). One of the first factors to consider is the choice of the *A. rhizogenes* strain. Several strains need to be tested to identify the bacteria capable of inducing hairy roots with a phenotype that is as close as possible to the one of the non-transformed roots. A very pronounced hairy root phenotype can profoundly alter root architecture and biotic interactions, thus affecting conclusions drawn concerning the function of the candidate genes (Dolatabadian et al. 2013). In the actinorhizal shrub *Discaria trinervis*, for example, both A4RS and ARqual strains induced transgenic roots at the site of infection, but they differed in their phenotype (Imanishi et al. 2011). Since the hypervirulent strain A4RS had a strong impact on root architecture, further experiments with composite plants of *D. trinervis* were conducted with Arqual. The second factor involved in a successful gene transfer is indeed linked to the host, which needs to provide the appropriate signaling molecules to activate the virulence genes of *A. rhizogenes*. The addition of exogenous phenolic compounds such as acetosyringone can sometimes improve the dialogue between the host and the agrobacterium (Lacroix and Citovsky 2013).

The co-cultivation phase, during which the host and the bacteria are usually in contact for 1–6 days, is another critical step in the interaction. It has been shown that the T-DNA transfer and integration can be affected by bacterial density, plant age and growth conditions, light, gas exchange, nutrient medium, growth regulators, pH, and humidity, among other factors (Karami 2008). Unfortunately, optimal conditions for the genetic transformation have to be studied empirically, requiring intensive work to combine the different factors.

12.2.2 *In Vitro and Ex Vitro Transformation Procedures*

Both in vitro and ex vitro techniques have been successfully used to generate composite plants. In the in vitro process, plants have to be germinated, grown, and manipulated in aseptic conditions. When young seedlings are used, inoculations with *A. rhizogenes* can be achieved by wounding the hypocotyls with a needle dipped in a fresh colony (or culture in exponential growth) of the chosen *A. rhizogenes* strain (i.e., Diouf et al. 1995). It has also been reported that the agrobacterium culture can be injected directly into the stem (Markmann et al. 2008). An alternative procedure consists in sectioning the radicle of the seedlings with a scalpel and then coating the sectioned surface with *A. rhizogenes* (Boisson-Dernier et al. 2001). The rate of development of hairy roots varies considerably depending on the method of infection. For instance, in the tropical tree *Casuarina glauca*, hairy roots developed in less than 30% of the plants with a sectioned hypocotyl, whereas when hypocotyls were inoculated with a needle, hairy roots developed on 95% of the plants (Svistoonoff et al. 2010). To obtain the composite plants, the normal non-transformed root system is removed about 3 weeks after inoculation with *A. rhizogenes*, and when possible, co-transformed roots containing the newly introduced genes from the appropriate binary vector are selected. It should be noted that, even though the shoot is not transgenic, composite plants sometimes exhibit an altered aerial part with shorter internodes. This alteration of phenotype is probably linked to the modification of the hormonal balance in the transgenic root system displaying the hairy root phenotype.

Ex vitro procedures may be preferred to avoid the constraints and costs linked to tissue culture and aseptic conditions. This technique was first reported in 2005 with the introduction and expression of the reporter gene *gfp* in hairy roots induced in 14 different plant species belonging to five different orders including nine plant families (Collier et al. 2005). Apical stems from young plants were directly inserted into rockwool cubes containing the *A. rhizogenes* inoculum. After 3 weeks to 2 months, hairy roots were observed on 56–100% of the inoculated stems, depending on the plant species. The major challenge of this simple procedure is preventing the dispersal of the transgenic pathogenic rhizobacteria in the environment, thus requiring an appropriate confined growth chamber or glasshouse.

12.2.3 *Selection of Co-transformed Hairy Roots*

One advantage of *A. rhizogenes*-mediated transformation is that transgenic roots can be obtained without using a selection agent. Hairy root morphology is used for the primary selection of transgenic roots. However, when performing co-transformation with an *A. rhizogenes* strain harboring a genetically engineered gene construct in a binary vector, a selection procedure with either a reporter gene or an antibiotic resistance gene is usually required to detect the co-transformed roots and to facilitate molecular and phenotypic analyses of the composite plants.

Based on experience gained with the actinorhizal tree *C. glauca*, and the analysis of several hundred composite plants, the rate of co-transformed hairy roots can vary from 20% to 65%. In order to identify the co-transformed roots, a constitutively expressed reporter gene such as β -glucuronidase (GUS) (Jefferson et al. 1987), DsRED1, or green fluorescent protein (GFP) gene (Haseloff and Siemerling 2006) was included in the T-DNA of the binary vector. Reporter genes encoding fluorescent proteins appeared to be the best candidates since their gene products could be visualized in roots under UV light without affecting the viability of plant tissues. Interestingly, the intensity of fluorescence was generally correlated with the level of expression of the other genes stacked on the T-DNA of the binary vector. In RNAi experiments designed to downregulate symbiotic genes in *C. glauca*, hairy roots displaying a high level of fluorescence also exhibited a strong extinction of the candidate symbiotic gene, as determined by q-RTPCR (Gherbi et al. 2008a).

Kanamycin selection of co-transformed roots has occasionally been performed using the *nptII* gene in the transferred T-DNA. A range of kanamycin concentrations has to be tested to inhibit the growth of non-co-transformed hairy roots on the agar plates. After 2 or 3 weeks of incubation with kanamycin, the non-co-transformed roots stop growing, turn brown, and do not penetrate the agar nutrient medium, whereas the co-transformed roots continue to grow rapidly on the agar. Once the hairy roots have developed, the antibiotic has to be rapidly removed to avoid a negative impact on the growth of the non-transformed aerial part of the composite plants.

12.3 Functional Analyses of Plant Genes in Composite Plants

In recent years, a wide diversity of composite plants have been used to improve the functional analysis of plant genes expressed in roots, the largest number of publications being in the area of plant-microbe interactions (Table 12.2). As illustrated below, the use of *A. rhizogenes* together with that of RNA interference (RNAi) has proven to be very useful to study gene function using reverse genetics.

12.3.1 Study of Interactions Between the Host Plant and Nitrogen-Fixing Microorganisms

Due to the difficulty in obtaining transgenic legumes using *A. tumefaciens*, composite plants were rapidly used to characterize the plant genes involved in the symbiotic process with nitrogen-fixing rhizobia. *A. rhizogenes* transformation was first described for *Lotus corniculatus* (Jensen et al. 1986) and subsequently used in the two model plants *Medicago truncatula* (Boisson-Dernier et al. 2001) and *Lotus*

Table 12.2 Examples of gene function analysis using composite plants obtained after genetic transformation using *Agrobacterium rhizogenes*

Plant	Gene	Function	References
<i>Aeschynomene indica</i>	<i>gus</i>	Reporter gene	Bonaldi et al. (2010)
<i>Allocauarina verticillata</i>	<i>gus</i>	Reporter gene	Gherbi et al. (2008b)
<i>Arabidopsis thaliana</i>	<i>KOJAK</i> <i>gfp</i>	Root hair development Reporter gene	Limpens et al. (2004) Collier et al. (2005)
<i>Arachis hypogaea</i>	<i>gfp</i> , <i>gus</i> <i>Cry8Ea1</i> <i>AdEXLB8</i> <i>EXLB</i>	Reporter genes Toxicity against white grubs Nematode resistance Stress-responsive expansin gene	Sinharoy et al. (2009) Geng et al. (2013) Guimaraes et al. (2017a) Guimaraes et al. (2017b)
<i>Camellia sinensis</i>	<i>gus</i>	Reporter gene	Alagarsamy et al. (2018)
<i>Casuarina glauca</i>	<i>gus</i> <i>SYMCK</i> <i>CHS</i> <i>CCaMK</i>	Reporter gene Root nodulation Flavonoid pathway Root nodulation	Diouf et al. (1995) Gherbi et al. (2008a) Abdel-Lateif et al. (2013) Svistoonoff et al. (2013)
<i>Coffea arabica</i>	<i>gus</i>	Reporter gene	Alpizar et al. (2006)
<i>Cucurbita pepo</i>	<i>DR5-gus</i> , <i>DR5-gfp</i>	Reporter genes driven by an auxin-responsive promoter	Ilina et al. (2012)
<i>Discaria trinervis</i>	<i>ENOD11-gus</i>	Marker of <i>Frankia</i> infection	Imanishi et al. (2011)
<i>Eucalyptus camaldulensis</i>	<i>gfp</i>	Reporter gene	Balasubramanian et al. (2011)
<i>Eucalyptus grandis</i>	<i>CCR1</i>	Lignin biosynthesis	Plasencia et al. (2016)
<i>Glycine max</i>	<i>IFS</i> <i>TIP1</i> <i>EXPB2</i> <i>SPX3</i> <i>Fib-1</i> <i>Y25C1A.5</i>	Isoflavone synthase Salt tolerance Cell wall β -expansin Phosphorous signaling pathway Nematode reproduction and fitness	Subramanian et al. (2004, 2006), White et al. (2015) An et al. (2017) Guo et al. (2011), Li et al. (2015) Yao et al. (2014) Li et al. (2010)
<i>Lotus japonicus</i>	<i>gus</i> , <i>luc</i>	Reporter genes	Stiller et al. (1997)
<i>Lupinus albus</i>	<i>LaMATE</i>	Phosphorous stress	Uhde-Stone et al. (2005)
<i>Lycopersicon esculentum</i>	<i>gfp</i>	Reporter gene	Collier et al. (2005)
<i>Medicago truncatula</i>	<i>ENOD11</i> <i>ENOD8</i> <i>ROP9</i> <i>RbohE</i> <i>ABCG10</i> <i>RDN</i>	Root infection by <i>Rhizobium</i> Root nodulation Oomycete colonization Role in arbuscule development ABC transporter of the G subfamily Root nodulation	Boisson-Dernier et al. (2001, 2005) Coque et al. (2008) Kiirika et al. (2012) Belmondo et al. (2016) Banasiak et al. (2013) Kassaw et al. (2017)
<i>Populus</i> spp.	<i>YFP</i>	Reporter gene	Neb et al. (2017)

(continued)

Table 12.2 (continued)

Plant	Gene	Function	References
<i>Persea americana</i>	<i>gus, gfp</i>	Reporter genes	Prabhu et al. (2017)
<i>Phaseolus vulgaris</i>	<i>NIN</i> <i>gus, gfp</i>	Root nodulation Reporter genes	Nanjareddy et al. (2017) Colpaert et al. (2008)
<i>Pisum sativum</i>	<i>LYK9</i>	Control of plant immunity	Leppyanen et al. (2017)
<i>Prunus cerasifera</i>	<i>Ma</i>	Nematode resistance	Claverie et al. (2011)
<i>Prunus</i> spp.	<i>Egfp</i>	Reporter gene	Bosselut et al. (2011)
<i>Solanum tuberosum</i>	<i>gus</i>	Reporter gene	Horn et al. (2014)
<i>Vicia hirsuta</i>	<i>gus</i>	Reporter gene	Quandt et al. (1993)
<i>Vigna unguiculata</i>	<i>RSG3-301</i>	Resistance to <i>Striga gesnerioides</i>	Mellor et al. (2012)
<i>Zea mays</i>	<i>gfp</i>	Reporter gene	Runo et al. (2012)

In this table, functional analyses include promoter studies, overexpression of the candidate genes, or RNAi experiments to downregulate the genes studied. Reporter genes were usually used to establish the proof of concept of the technology.

ABCG, ATP-binding cassette transporter of the G family; ABC transporter; CCaMK, calcium/calmodulin-dependent kinase; CCR1, cinnamoyl-CoA reductase 1; CHS, chalcone synthase; CRY8Ea1, CRY protein from *Bacillus thuringiensis*; DR5, auxin-responsive promoter; ENOD8, nodule-specific esterase; ENOD11, early nodulin; EXL, expansin-like protein; EXP, expansin gene; gfp, green fluorescent protein gene; gus, β -glucuronidase gene; IFS, isoflavone synthase gene; KOJAK, cellulose synthase-like protein; LaMATE, *Lupinus albus* multidrug and toxin efflux; luc, luciferase; LYK9, Lys-M-receptor like kinase; Ma, R protein; NIN, nodule inception gene; RbohE, NADPH oxidase; RDN, root-determined nodulation protein; ROP9, GTPase; SPX, protein related to phosphate homeostasis and signaling; SYMRK, symbiosis receptor kinase; TIP, tonoplast intrinsic protein; Yfp, yellow fluorescent protein gene

japonicus (Stiller et al. 1997). Composite plants have also been reported in *Glycine max* (Kereszt et al. 2007; Cao et al. 2009), *Vicia hirsuta* (Quandt et al. 1993), *Vigna aconitifolia* (Lee et al. 1993), *Phaseolus vulgaris* (Estrada-Navarrete et al. 2006; Colpaert et al. 2008), *Trifolium rubens* (Diaz et al. 1989), and *T. pratense* (Diaz et al. 2000).

Composite plants have largely contributed to a better understanding of the symbiotic dialogue established between the host and nitrogen-fixing rhizobial strains, in legumes which develop determinate or indeterminate nodules, and which undergo either an intracellular or intercellular infection process. Whereas mutants in the model plants *M. truncatula* and *L. japonicus* led to the identification of the so-called common symbiotic pathway (CSP) (Gueurts et al. 2016), RNAi experiments in composite plants confirmed that the CSP was also involved in the nodulation process of legumes in which the infection process does not proceed via root hair infection, such as *Sesbania rostrata* (Van de Velde et al. 2003), *Arachis hypogaea* (Sinharoy et al. 2009), and *Aeschynomene indica* (Bonaldi et al. 2010).

Major advances have also been made in actinorhizal plants which develop nitrogen-fixing nodules following interaction with the gram-positive actinobacteria

Frankia. Since it takes about 12 months to obtain transgenic nodulated plants of *C. glauca* resulting from a T-DNA transfer by *A. tumefaciens* (Smouni et al. 2002), composite plants were used to generate data on a large number of co-transformed hairy roots more rapidly. This method was first used in 1995 (Diouf et al. 1995) to demonstrate that a promoter from a legume hemoglobin gene kept its spatiotemporal pattern of expression in an actinorhizal nodule, thus suggesting the conservation of molecular mechanisms underlying the nodulation process between actinorhizal plants and legumes. With the development of the RNAi technology, downregulation of two genes isolated from *C. glauca* and sharing homology with the receptor-like kinase SYMRK and the calcium- and calmodulin-dependent kinase CCaMK genes from the CSP in legumes revealed that this pathway was also required by *Frankia* for root infection and nodulation (Gherbi et al. 2008a; Svistoonoff et al. 2013). Additional data obtained in composite plants of two other actinorhizal plants *D. trinervis* (Imanishi et al. 2011) and *Datisca glomerata* (Markmann et al. 2008), which cannot be transformed by *A. tumefaciens*, have also considerably enriched our knowledge of the original nodulation process resulting from *Frankia* intercellular infection.

12.3.2 Plant Mycorrhizal Interactions

Arbuscular mycorrhiza is a major widespread mutualistic association that concerns 80% of land plants and involves fungi of the phylum Glomeromycota. The plant provides carbohydrates to the fungus which, in return, supplies the host with mineral nutrients, especially phosphate, and improves water absorption and disease resistance (Lanfranco et al. 2016).

In *M. truncatula*, together with the possibility to obtain nitrogen-fixing nodules on composite plants, it has been shown that these roots can be colonized by endomycorrhizal fungi, even when the hairy roots are excised from the composite plants and propagated as independent organs (Boisson-Dernier et al. 2001, 2005; Mrosk et al. 2009). With the actinorhizal plant *C. glauca*, it was not possible to grow hairy roots independently, but mycorrhization by *Rhizophagus irregularis* occurred on the hairy roots of composite plants (Gherbi et al. 2008a). Composite legume and actinorhizal plants were further used to compare gene expression during the symbiotic process with rhizobium and/or *Frankia* and in endomycorrhizal associations. These experiments, together with the study of legume mutants, have provided evidence that the common signaling pathway involved in the nodulation process is necessary for all root endosymbioses involving rhizobium, *Frankia*, and AM fungi (Gherbi et al. 2008a; Markmann et al. 2008).

Composite plants have also been used to characterize some candidate genes potentially involved in specific stages of the endomycorrhization process. For example, co-transformed hairy roots of *M. truncatula* highlighted the role of a NADPH oxidase encoded by the gene *RbohE* during arbuscule accommodation within cortical root cells (Belmondo et al. 2016).

12.3.3 Plant Nematode Interaction

Meloidogyne species of root-knot nematodes (RKN) attack the roots of most vegetable, fruit, and ornamental crops under Mediterranean and tropical climates. Infested roots become distorted and develop rounded or irregular galls which alter water and nutrient uptake, thereby reducing plant growth and yield (Fosu-Nyarko and Jones 2016). Composite plants for studying nematode resistance have been documented in *Lycopersicon esculentum* cv. (Collier et al. 2005), *Glycine max* (Li et al. 2010), *Prunus* spp. (Claverie et al. 2011), *Arachis hypogaea* (Guimaraes et al. 2017a), and *Persea americana* (Prabhu et al. 2017).

In *Prunus* species, composite plants have been used to validate the function of the candidate gene *Ma* isolated in *Prunus cerasifera* (Claverie et al. 2011). When co-transformed roots expressed the *Ma* genomic sequence under the control of its native promoter, a high level of resistance was obtained to the three major RKNs *Meloidogyne incognita*, *M. arenaria*, and *M. javanica*.

Several RKN species are pathogenic on *A. hypogaea* and cause considerable yield losses in Africa every year. In wild-type *Arachis* species which are resistant to a number of pests and diseases, transcriptomic studies have identified candidate genes that could contribute to resistance to *M. arenaria*. Since peanut is recalcitrant to genetic transformation, *A. rhizogenes* was tested as an alternative to develop the functional analysis of plant genes. Using the *A. rhizogenes* strain K599, the candidate gene for nematode resistance *AdEXLB8* was overexpressed in hairy roots induced on the peanut cultivar “Runner.” Two months after *M. arenaria* infection, a reduction of 98% in the number of galls and egg masses was observed compared to the control hairy roots (Guimaraes et al. 2017b).

12.3.4 Interactions of Hairy Roots with Parasitic Plants

Striga is one of the most important genera of parasitic plants and causes devastating losses in cereal yields in sub-Saharan Africa. It is an obligate hemiparasitic parasite that attaches to host roots, forms a haustorium, and penetrates the root cortex of potential hosts. It then damages cereal crops by draining off water and nutrients, impairing photosynthesis, and having a phytotoxic effect (Yoshida et al. 2016). The combination of these factors severely reduces the growth of the crops and causes the subsequent failure to set seeds. Understanding the molecular mechanisms underlying the plant-parasitic weed interaction is essential for the identification of genes that could improve crop yield via biotechnological or marker-assisted breeding strategies.

The possibility for *Striga* to parasite hairy roots of composite plants has been demonstrated. *Striga gesnerioides* (L.) is a major parasite of the grain legume cowpea (*Vigna unguiculata*) in Africa. Following infection with the *A. rhizogenes* strain R1000, composite plants of *V. unguiculata* were obtained using an ex vitro

protocol, and co-transformed roots were selected using *gfp* as biomarker (Mellor et al. 2012). Up to 80% of the inoculated plants developed at least one transgenic root. When subjected to *Striga*, hairy roots of composite plants responded similarly to wild-type roots of the susceptible cowpea cultivar, allowing the formation and growth of parasite tubercles on the legume transformed roots. When the gene *RSG3-301* encoding a resistance (R) gene to *Striga* was co-transformed in the hairy roots of a susceptible cowpea genotype, its expression resulted in the acquisition of a resistant phenotype. These data demonstrate that the expression of the oncogenes from *A. rhizogenes* has no impact on the cowpea-*Striga* interaction.

Runo et al. (2012) reported a similar approach using *Zea mays*. Using the strain K599, composite maize plants with co-transformed roots were obtained in vitro on 85.3% of the inoculated seedlings. Two weeks after inoculation with *Striga hermonthica*, the number and size of *S. hermonthica* individuals infecting transformed or wild-type roots of maize were identical. Microscopic examination of the infected roots further confirmed that the timing and characteristics of the infection process were not altered in the hairy roots. These data confirm that composite plants will be suitable for the characterization of plant genes which play a critical role in parasitism or host defense.

12.3.5 Hairy Roots for the Study of Wood Formation

Since the regeneration of transgenic forest trees is limited to a small number of species due to poor regeneration ability and difficulty to achieve T-DNA transfer by *A. tumefaciens*, *A. rhizogenes* appeared to be a viable alternative. Composite plants have now been reported in several forest trees including *Eucalyptus camaldulensis* (Balasubramanian et al. 2011) and *E. grandis* (Plasencia et al. 2016) and recently in poplar (Neb et al. 2017).

Whereas poplar has been the main forest tree used to advance our knowledge of the lignification process in forest trees, other trees such as eucalyptus are of major economic value. With the release of the *Eucalyptus grandis* genome sequence, many candidate genes involved in wood formation have been identified, paving the way for functional analysis. Due to the recalcitrance of *E. grandis* to *Agrobacterium*, the hypervirulent A4RS strain had to be used to obtain efficient transformation (62% on average) (Plasencia et al. 2016). Microscopic examination showed that xylem development was similar in both hairy and wild-type roots. A proof of concept of the composite plant approach was obtained with the downregulation of the cinnamoyl-CoA reductase1 gene (*EgCCR1*) in *E. grandis*, encoding a key enzyme from the lignin biosynthetic pathway. As expected, the expression of an *EgCCR1* antisense construct led to a decrease in lignin content. The authors also demonstrated that composite plants were suitable for the analysis of the expression pattern conferred by promoters from genes involved in the lignin biosynthetic pathway.

12.4 Genome Editing in Transgenic Roots of Composite Plants

The first reports of CRISPR/Cas9 editing in plants appeared in 2013, with successful application for both transient expression and recovery of stable transgenic lines. In addition to demonstration of efficacy in the model plants *Arabidopsis thaliana* and *Nicotiana benthamiana* (Li et al. 2014), there have also been many reports on different crop species including rice (Miao et al. 2013), maize (Liang et al. 2014), and wheat (Wang et al. 2014). Because of the ease of use and low cost, CRISPR/Cas9 has rapidly become the tool of choice for gene editing and creating knockout mutants in plants (Belhaj et al. 2015; Liu et al. 2016; Nogu   et al. 2016). However, a prerequisite for the application of the technology is the ability to deliver guide RNAs (gRNAs) and the CRISPR-associated protein 9 to the target cells either stably or transiently. When it is not possible to regenerate edited plants after transient expression of the gRNA and Cas9 in protoplasts and a genetic transformation procedure with *A. tumefaciens* is not available either, composite plants offer an alternative for creating mutations in root-expressed genes (Table 12.3).

The potential of the CRISPR/Cas9 system to induce gene mutations using hairy root transformation was first tested in tomato and targeted the *SHORT-ROOT* (*SHR*)

Table 12.3 Use of genome editing for gene function analysis in composite plants

Plant	Gene	Function	References
<i>Brassica carinata</i>	<i>FLA1</i>	Adhesion molecule	Kirchner et al. (2017)
<i>Glycine max</i>	<i>FEI1</i> , <i>FEI2</i> <i>SHR</i> <i>GS1</i> <i>CHI</i> <i>PDS</i> <i>Rfg1</i>	Plant signaling Seed coat development Nitrogen metabolism Flavonoid pathway Carotenoid biosynthesis path- way Resistance to nodulation	Cai et al. (2015) Jacobs et al. (2015) Du et al. (2016) Fan et al. (2017)
<i>Lotus japonicus</i>	<i>SYMRK</i>	Symbiotic nitrogen fixation	Wang et al. (2016)
<i>Medicago truncatula</i>	<i>gus</i>	Proof of concept	Michno et al. (2015)
<i>Salvia miltiorrhiza</i>	<i>CPS1</i> <i>RAS</i>	Diterpenoid biosynthesis Phenolic acid biosynthetic pathway	Li et al. (2017) Zhou et al. (2018)
<i>Solanum lycopersicum</i>	<i>SHORT-ROOT</i> , <i>SCARECROW</i>	Root development	Ron et al. (2014)
<i>Taraxacum kok-saghyz</i>	<i>1-FFT</i>	Inulin biosynthesis	Iaffaldano et al. (2016)

1-FFT, fructan 1-fructosyltransferase; CHI, chalcone-flavone isomerase; CPS1, diterpene synthase; FEI1 and FEI2, leucine-rich receptor kinase; FLA1, fasciclin-like arabinogalactan protein 1; GS, glutamine synthase; gus, β -glucuronidase; PDS, phytoene desaturase; RAS, rosmarinic acid synthase; Rfg1, plant resistance protein; SCARECROW and SHORT-ROOT, *Gras* transcription factors regulating root patterning; SHR, seed coat wrinkling; SYMRK, symbiosis receptor kinase

sequence expressed in root vascular tissue and encoding a transcription factor (Ron et al. 2014). Several hairy roots genetically transformed with a gRNA targeting the coding sequence of *SHR* were obtained and characterized by a short meristem. Sequence analysis of the targeted gene in putatively edited roots confirmed that the *SHR* coding region contained a variety of insertion and deletion (indel) mutations. The alterations in the root phenotype were the result of defects in stem cell division and cell patterning and were consistent with the phenotype of *Arabidopsis shr* mutants. From these data, it was concluded that *SHR* function was conserved between tomato and *Arabidopsis*.

Similar experiments were performed on the nitrogen-fixing legumes *M. truncatula* (Michno et al. 2015), *G. max* (Cai et al. 2015; Du et al. 2016; Jacobs et al. 2015; Michno et al. 2015; Sun et al. 2015), and *L. japonicus* (Wang et al. 2016). Previously reported ex vitro or in vitro composite plant transformation assays were used to introduce T-DNA gene constructs with the designed gRNA and codon-optimized gene encoding the Cas9 protein. Sequencing of the targeted genes revealed mutations induced by the CRISPR/Cas9 system. Following the analysis of 11 targeted loci in soybean, DNA mutations mainly consisting of small deletions were detected in 95% of the hairy roots (Jacobs et al. 2015). One limitation of the CRISPR/Cas9 system is possible off-target mutations that may alter the expression of genes that were not originally targeted. Experiments on soybean composite plants indicate that off-target mutations do occur, although at low rates (Jacobs et al. 2015).

The CRISPR/Cas9 system is also effective for the study of biosynthetic pathways. Two genes isolated in the Chinese medicinal plant *Salvia miltiorrhiza* coding for water-soluble phenolic acids have been successfully targeted (Zhou et al. 2018). When the diterpene synthase gene *SmCPSI* from the tanshinone biosynthetic pathway was edited, a mutation rate of 42.3% was obtained in the hairy roots, and tanshinone was absent in the homozygous plants (Li et al. 2017). The second gene targeted was rosmarinic acid synthase (*SmRAS*). The level of *RAS* expression was reduced in successfully edited plant roots, revealing a promising potential method to regulate plant metabolic networks and improve the quality of medicinal herbs.

From these recent studies, it can be concluded that CRISPR/Cas9 and related genome editing methods will facilitate a wide range of functional analyses in roots of composite plants, since specific mutations and knockout mutants can be easily obtained, even in non-model plants (Wang et al. 2017).

12.5 Conclusions

The first composite plant obtained after T-DNA transfer with *A. rhizogenes* was reported more than 20 years ago in the legume *L. corniculatus*, the aim being to study genes involved in nodulation with rhizobia. The feasibility and potential of this simple low-cost approach have now been demonstrated in numerous legume and nonlegume plant species. Experiments show that *A. rhizogenes* is a useful tool to rapidly test gene expression and function in the context of root development and in

response to the biotic and abiotic environment. Furthermore, recent findings demonstrate that the CRISPR/Cas9 technology can also be used to induce targeted indel mutations in the root system of composite plants.

While studies on hairy roots advance the speed of the investigations in plants which are also amenable to genetic transformation by *A. tumefaciens*, sometimes they are the only way to obtain gene transfer in plant species that remain recalcitrant to in vitro regeneration and/or T-DNA transfer by *A. tumefaciens* or direct gene techniques. In the future, this system will thus certainly continue to be a valuable way to advance functional genomic research and to improve our knowledge of the molecular mechanisms underlying a wide range of processes in root-microbe and root-parasitic interactions, root development, and root adaptation to abiotic stress.

Acknowledgments Dr. Chonglu Zhong acknowledges the supports of the Specific Program for National Non-profit Scientific Institutions (CAFYBB2018ZB003) and CAF International Cooperation Innovation Project “Tropical Tree Genetic Resources and Genetic Diversity.” Research conducted at the Institute of Forest Genetics and Tree Breeding was supported by the Indian Council of Forestry Research and Education, Dehradun, India. Research conducted in UMR DIADE was supported by the Research Institute for sustainable Development and the University of Montpellier, France.

References

- Abdel-Lateif K, Vaissayre V, Gherbi H et al (2013) Silencing of the chalcone synthase gene in *Casuarina glauca* highlights the important role of flavonoids during nodulation. *New Phytol* 199:1012–1021
- Alagarsamy K, Shamala LF, Wei S (2018) Protocol: high-efficiency *in-planta* *Agrobacterium*-mediated transgenic hairy root induction of *Camellia sinensis* var. *sinensis*. *Plant Methods* 14:17
- Alpizar E, Dechamp E, Espeout S et al (2006) Efficient production of *Agrobacterium rhizogenes*-transformed roots and composite plants for studying gene expression in coffee roots. *Plant Cell Rep* 25:959–967
- An J, Hu Z, Che B, Chen H et al (2017) Heterologous expression of *Panax ginseng* *PgTIP1* confers enhanced salt tolerance of soybean cotyledon hairy roots, composite, and whole plants. *Front Plant Sci* 8:1232
- Anami S, Njuguna E, Coussens G et al (2013) Higher plant transformation: principles and molecular tools. *Int J Dev Biol* 57:483–494
- Balasubramanian A, Venkatachalam R, Selvakesavan R et al (2011) Optimisation of methods for *Agrobacterium rhizogenes* mediated generation of composite plants in *Eucalyptus camaldulensis*. *BMC Proc* 5(suppl. 7):45–46
- Banasia J, Biala W, Staszko A et al (2013) A *Medicago truncatula* ABC transporter belonging to subfamily G modulates the level of isoflavonoids. *J Exp Bot* 64(4):1005–1015
- Beach KH, Gresshoff PM (1988) Characterization and culture of *Agrobacterium rhizogenes* transformed roots of forage Legumes. *Plant Sci* 57:73–81
- Belhaj K, Chaparro-Garcia A, Kamoun S et al (2015) Editing plant genomes with CRISPR/Cas9. *Curr Opin Biotechnol* 32:76–84
- Belmondo S, Calcagno C, Genre A (2016) The *Medicago truncatula* *MtRbohE* gene is activated in arbusculated cells and is involved in root cortex colonization. *Planta* 243:251–262

- Boisson-Dernier A, Chabaud M, Garcia F et al (2001) *Agrobacterium rhizogenes*-transformed roots of *Medicago truncatula* for the study of nitrogen-fixing and endomycorrhizal symbiotic associations. *Mol Plant Microbe Interact* 14:695–700
- Boisson-Dernier A, Andriankaja A, Chabaud M et al (2005) *MtENOD11* gene activation during rhizobial infection and mycorrhizal arbuscule development requires a common AT-rich-containing regulatory sequence. *Mol Plant Microbe Interact* 18:1269–1276
- Bonaldi K, Gherbi H, Franche C et al (2010) The Nod factor-independent symbiotic signalling pathway: development of *Agrobacterium rhizogenes*-mediated transformation for the legume *Aeschynomene indica*. *Mol Plant Microbe Interact* 12:1537–1544
- Bosselut N, Van Ghelder C, Claverie M et al (2011) *Agrobacterium rhizogenes*-mediated transformation of *Prunus* as an alternative for gene functional analysis in hairy-roots and composite plants. *Plant Cell Rep* 30:1313–1326
- Britton MT, Escobar MA, Dandekar M (2008) The oncogenes of *Agrobacterium tumefaciens* and *Agrobacterium rhizogenes*. In: Tzfira T, Citovsky V (eds) *Agrobacterium: from biology to biotechnology*. Springer, Heidelberg, pp 525–563
- Cai Y, Chen L, Liu X et al (2015) CRISPR/Cas9-mediated genome editing in soybean hairy roots. *PLoS One* 10(8):e0136064
- Cao D, Hou W, Song S et al (2009) Assessment of conditions affecting *Agrobacterium rhizogenes*-mediated transformation of soybean. *Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult* 96:45–52
- Claverie M, Dirlwanger E, Bosselut N et al (2011) The *Ma* gene for complete-spectrum resistance to *Meloidogyne* species in *Prunus* is a TNL with a huge repeated C-terminal post-LRR region. *Plant Physiol* 156:779–792
- Collier R, Fuchs B, Walter N et al (2005) *Ex vitro* composite plants: an inexpensive, rapid method for root biology. *Plant J* 43:449–457
- Colpaert N, Tilleman S, van Montagu M et al (2008) Composite *Phaseolus vulgaris* plants with transgenic roots as research tool. *African J Biotechnol* 7:404–408
- Coque L, Neogi P, Pislariu C et al (2008) Transcription of *ENOD8* in *Medicago truncatula* nodules directs ENOD8 esterase to developing and mature symbiosomes. *Mol Plant Microbe Interact* 21:404–410
- Díaz CL, Melchers LS, Hooykaas PJJ et al (1989) Root lectin as a determinant of host-plant specificity in the Rhizobium-legume symbiosis. *Nature* 338:579–581
- Díaz CL, Spaink JD, Kijne JW (2000) Heterologous rhizobial lipochitin oligosaccharides and chitin oligomers induce cortical cell divisions in red clover roots, transformed with the pea lectin gene. *Mol Plant-Microbe Interact* 13:268–276
- Diouf D, Gherbi H, Prin Y et al (1995) Hairy root nodulation of *Casuarina glauca*: a system for the study of symbiotic gene expression in an actinorhizal tree. *Mol Plant Microbe Interact* 8 (4):532–537
- Dolatabadian A, Modarres Sanavy SA et al (2013) *Agrobacterium rhizogenes* transformed soybean roots differ in their nodulation and nitrogen fixation response to genistein and salt stress. *World J Microbiol Biotechnol* 29:1327–1339
- Du H, Zeng X, Zhao M et al (2016) Efficient targeted mutagenesis in soybean by TALENs and CRISPR/Cas9. *J Biotechnol* 217:90–97
- Estrada-Navarrete G, Alvarado-Affantranger X, Olivares JE et al (2006) *Agrobacterium rhizogenes* transformation of the *Phaseolus* spp.: a tool for functional genomics. *Mol Plant Microbe Interact* 19:1385–1393
- Fan Y, Liu J, Lyu S et al (2017) The Soybean *Rfg1* gene restricts nodulation by *Sinorhizobium fredii* USDA193. *Front Plant Sci* 8:1548
- Fosu-Nyarko J, Jones MG (2016) Advances in understanding the molecular mechanisms of root lesion nematode host interactions. *Annu Rev Phytopathol* 54:253–278
- Geng L, Chi J, Shu C, Gresshoff PM et al (2013) A chimeric *cry8Ea1* gene flanked by MARs efficiently controls *Holotrichia parallela*. *Plant Cell Rep* 32:1211–1218
- Geurts R, Xiao TT, Reinhold-Hurek B (2016) What does it take to evolve a nitrogen-fixing endosymbiosis? *Trends Plant Sci* 21:199–208

- Gherbi H, Svistoonoff S, Estevan J et al (2008a) *SymRK* defines a common genetic basis for plant root endosymbioses with AM fungi, rhizobia and *Frankia* bacteria. *Proc National Acad Sci USA* 105:4928–4932
- Gherbi H, Nambiar-Veetil M, Zhong C et al (2008b) Post-transcriptional gene silencing in the root system of the actinorhizal tree *Allocauarina verticillata*. *Mol Plant Microbe Interact* 21:518–524
- Guillon S, Trémouillaux-Guiller J, Kumar Pati P et al (2006) Hairy root research: recent scenario and exciting prospects. *Cur Opin Plant Biol* 9:341–346
- Guimaraes LA, Pereira BM, Araujo ACG et al (2017a) *Ex vitro* hairy root induction in detached peanut leaves for plant-nematode interaction studies. *Plant Methods* 13:25
- Guimaraes LA, Mota APZ, Araujo ACG et al (2017b) Genome-wide analysis of expansin superfamily in wild *Arachis* discloses a stress-responsive expansin-like B gene. *Plant Mol Biol* 94:79–96
- Guo W, Zhao J, Li X, Qin L et al (2011) A soybean β -expansin gene *GmEXPB2* intrinsically involved in root system architecture responses to abiotic stresses. *Plant J* 66:541–552
- Hansen J, Jorgensen JE, Stougaard J, Marcker K (1989) Hairy roots – a short cut to transgenic root nodules. *Plant Cell Rep* 8:12–15
- Haselhoff J, Siemerling KR (2006) The use of green fluorescent protein in plants. *Methods Biochem Anal* 47:259–284
- Horn P, Santala J, Nielsen SL et al (2014) Composite potato plants with transgenic roots on non-transgenic shoots: a model system for studying gene silencing in roots. *Plant Cell Rep* 33:1977–1992
- Iaffaldano B, Zhang Y, Cornish K (2016) CRISPR/Cas9 genome editing of rubber producing dandelion *Taraxacum kok-saghyz* using *Agrobacterium rhizogenes* without selection. *Ind Crop Prod* 89:356–362
- Ilina EL, Logachov AA, Laplaze L et al (2012) Composite *Cucurbita pepo* plants with transgenic roots as a tool to study root development. *Ann Bot* 110:479–489
- Imanishi L, Vayssières A, Franche C et al (2011) Transformed hairy roots of *Discaria trinervis*: a valuable tool for studying actinorhizal symbiosis in the context of intercellular infection. *Mol Plant Microbe Interact* 24:1317–1324
- Jacobs TB, LaFayette PR, Schmitz RJ, Parrott WA (2015) Targeted genome modifications in soybean with CRISPR/Cas9. *BMC Biotechnol* 15:16
- Jefferson RA, Kavanagh TA, Bevan MW (1987) GUS fusion: β -glucuronidase as a sensitive and versatile gene fusion marker in higher plants. *EMBO J* 6:3901–3907
- Jensen JS, Marcker KA, Otten L, Schell J (1986) Nodule-specific expression of a chimeric soybean leghemoglobin gene in transgenic *Lotus corniculatus*. *Nature* 321:669–674
- Karami O (2008) Factors affecting *Agrobacterium*-mediated transformation of plants. *Transgenic Plant J* 2:127–137
- Kassaw T, Nowak S, Schnabel E, Frugoli J (2017) ROOT DETERMINED NODULATION1 is required for *M. truncatula* CLE12, but not CLE13, peptide signaling through the SUNN receptor kinase. *Plant Physiol* 174:2445–2456
- Kereszt A, Li D, Indrasumunar A et al (2007) *Agrobacterium rhizogenes*-mediated transformation of soybean to study root biology. *Nature Protoc* 2:948–952
- Kiirika LM, Bergmann HF, Schikowsky C et al (2012) Silencing of the Rac1 GTPase *MtROP9* in *Medicago truncatula* stimulates early mycorrhizal and oomycete root colonizations but negatively affects rhizobial infection. *Plant Physiol* 159:501–516
- Kirchner TW, Niehaus M, Debener T et al (2017) Efficient generation of mutations mediated by CRISPR/Cas9 in the hairy root transformation system of *Brassica carinata*. *PLoS One* 12: e0185429
- Koplow J, Byrne MC, Jen G et al (1984) Physical map of the *Agrobacterium rhizogenes* strain 8196 virulence plasmid. *Plasmid* 11:130–140
- Lacroix B, Citovsky V (2013) The roles of bacterial and host plant factors in *Agrobacterium*-mediated genetic transformation. *Int J Dev Biol* 57:46481

- Lanfranco L, Bonfante P, Genre A (2016) The mutualistic interaction between plants and arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi. *Microbiol Spectr* 4(6)
- Lee NG, Stein B, Suzuki H, Verma DPS (1993) Expression of antisense nodulin-35 RNA in *Vigna aconitifolia* transgenic root nodules retards peroxisome development and affects nitrogen availability to the plant. *Plant J* 3:599–606
- Leppyanen IV, Shakhnazarova VY, Shtark OY et al (2017) Receptor-like kinase LYK9 in *Pisum sativum* L. is the CERK1-Like Receptor that controls both plant immunity and AM symbiosis development. *Int J Mol Sci* 19(1):E8
- Li J, Todd TC, Trick HN (2010) Rapid *in planta* evaluation of root expressed transgenes in chimeric soybean plants. *Plant Cell Rep* 29:113–123
- Li J-F, Zhang D, Sheen J (2014) Cas9-based genome editing in Arabidopsis and tobacco. *Methods Enzymol* 546:459–472
- Li X, Zhao J, Tan Z et al (2015) GmEXPB2, a cell wall β -expansin, affects soybean nodulation through modifying root architecture and promoting nodule formation and development. *Plant Physiol* 169:2640–2653
- Li B, Cui G, Shen G, Zhan Z et al (2017) Targeted mutagenesis in the medicinal plant *Salvia miltiorrhiza*. *Sci Rep* 7:43320
- Liang Z, Zhang K, Chen K, Gao C (2014) Targeted mutagenesis in *Zea mays* using TALENs and the CRISPR/Cas system. *J Genet Genom* 41:63–68
- Limpens E, Ramos J, Franken C et al (2004) RNA interference in *Agrobacterium rhizogenes*-transformed roots of *Arabidopsis* and *Medicago truncatula*. *J Exp Bot* 55:983–992
- Liu D, Hu R, Palla KJ et al (2016) Advances and perspectives on the use of CRISPR/Cas9 systems in plant genomics research. *Curr Opin Plant Biol* 30:70–77
- Markmann K, Giczey C, Parniske M (2008) Functional adaptation of a plant receptor-kinase paved the way for the evolution of intracellular root symbioses with bacteria. *PLoS Biol* 6:e68
- Mehrotra S, Srivastava V, Ur Rahman L, Kukreja AK (2015) Hairy root biotechnology – indicative timeline to understand missing links and future outlook. *Protoplasma* 252:1189–1201
- Mellor KE, Hoffman AM, Timko MP (2012) Use of *ex vitro* composite plants to study the interaction of cowpea (*Vigna unguiculata* L.) with the root parasitic angiosperm *Striga gesnerioides*. *Plant Methods* 8(1):22
- Miao J, Guo D, Zhang J et al (2013) Targeted mutagenesis in rice using CRISPR-Cas system. *Cell Res* 23:1233–1236
- Michno JM, Wang X, Liu J et al (2015) CRISPR/Cas mutagenesis of soybean and *Medicago truncatula* using a new web-tool and a modified Cas9 enzyme. *GM Crops Food* 6:243–252
- Mrosk C, Forner S, Hause G et al (2009) Composite *Medicago truncatula* plants harbouring *Agrobacterium rhizogenes*-transformed roots reveal normal mycorrhization by *Glomus intraradices*. *J Exp Bot* 60:3797–3807
- Nanjareddy K, Arthikala MK, Aguirre AL et al (2017) Plant promoter analysis: identification and characterization of root nodule specific promoter in the common bean. *J Vis Exp* 130
- Neb D, Das A, Hintelmann A, Nehls U (2017) Composite poplars: a novel tool for ectomycorrhizal research. *Plant Cell Rep* 36:1959–1970
- Nogu   F, Mara K, Collonnier C, Casacuberta JM (2016) Genome engineering and plant breeding: impact on trait discovery and development. *Plant Cell Rep* 35:1475–1486
- Plasencia A, Soler M, Dupas A et al (2016) Eucalyptus hairy roots, a fast, efficient and versatile tool to explore function and expression of genes involved in wood formation. *Plant Biotechnol J* 14:1381–1393
- Prabhu SA, Ndlovu B, Engelbrecht J, van den Berg N (2017) Generation of composite *Persea americana* (Mill.) (avocado) plants: a proof-of-concept-study. *PLoS One* 12:e0185896
- Quandt H-J, P  hler A, Broer I (1993) Transgenic root nodules of *Vicia hirsuta*: a fast and efficient system for the study of gene expression in indeterminate-type nodules. *Mol Plant-Microbe Interact* 6:699–706
- Ree SY, Mutwill M (2014) Towards revealing the functions of all genes in plants. *Trends Plant Sci* 19:212–221

- Ron M, Kajala K, Pauluzzi G et al (2014) Hairy root transformation using *Agrobacterium rhizogenes* as a tool for exploring cell type-specific gene expression and function using tomato as a model. *Plant Physiol* 166:455–469
- Runo S, Macharia S, Alakonya A et al (2012) Striga parasitizes transgenic hairy roots of *Zea mays* and provides a tool for studying plant-plant interactions. *Plant Methods* 8:20
- Sinha Roy S, Saha S, Chaudhury SR, Dasgupta M (2009) Transformed hairy roots of *Arachis hypogaea*: a tool for studying root nodule symbiosis in a non-infection thread legume of the *Aeschynomene* tribe. *Mol Plant Microbe Interact* 22:132–142
- Smouni A, Laplaze L, Bogusz D et al (2002) The 35S promoter is not constitutively expressed in the transgenic tropical actinorhizal tree, *Casuarina glauca*. *Funct Plant Biol* 29:649–656
- Stiller J, Martirani L, Tuppal S et al (1997) High frequency transformation and regeneration of transgenic plants in the model *Lotus japonicus*. *J Exp Bot* 48:1357–1365
- Subramanian S, Hu X, Lu G et al (2004) The promoters of two isoflavone synthase genes respond differentially to nodulation and defense signals in transgenic soybean roots. *Plant Mol Biol* 54:623–639
- Subramanian S, Stacey G, Yu O (2006) Endogenous isoflavones are essential for the establishment of symbiosis between soybean and *Bradyrhizobium japonicum*. *Plant J* 48:261–273
- Sun X, Hu Z, Chen R et al (2015) Targeted mutagenesis in soybean using the CRISPR-Cas9 system. *Sci Rep* 5:10342
- Swistonoff S, Gherbi H, Nambiar-Veetil M et al (2010) Contribution of transgenic Casuarinaceae to our knowledge of the actinorhizal symbiosis. *Symbiosis* 50:3–11
- Swistonoff S, Benabdoun FM, Nambiar-Veetil M et al (2013) The independent acquisition of plant root nitrogen-fixing symbiosis in Fabids recruited the same genetic pathway for nodule organogenesis. *PLoS One* 8(5):e64515
- Talano MA, Oller AL, Gonzalez P, Agostini E (2012) Hairy roots, their multiple applications and recent patents. *Recent Pt Biotechnol* 6:115–133
- Tepfer D (1990) Genetic transformation using *Agrobacterium rhizogenes*. *Physiol Plant* 79:140–146
- Uhde-Stone C, Liu J, Allan DL, Vance C (2005) Transgenic proteoid roots of white lupin: a vehicle for characterizing and silencing root genes involved in adaptation to P stress. *Plant J* 44:840–853
- Van de Velde W, Mergeay J, Hoslters M, Goormachtig S (2003) *Agrobacterium rhizogenes*-mediated transformation of *Sesbania rostrata*. *Plant Sci* 165:1281–1288
- Wang Y, Cheng X, Shan Q et al (2014) Simultaneous editing of three homoeoalleles in hexaploid bread wheat confers heritable resistance to powdery mildew. *Nature Biotechnol* 32:947–951
- Wang L, Wang L, Tan Q et al (2016) Efficient inactivation of symbiotic nitrogen fixation related genes in *Lotus japonicus* using CRISPR-Cas9. *Front Plant Sci* 7:1333
- Wang L, Wang L, Zhou Y, Duanmu D (2017) Use of CRISPR/Cas9 for symbiotic nitrogen fixation research in Legumes. *Prog Mol Biol Transl Sci* 149:187–213
- White LJ, Jothibasu K, Reese RN et al (2015) Spatio temporal influence of isoflavonoids on bacterial diversity in the soybean rhizosphere. *Mol Plant Microbe Interact* 28:22–29
- Yao Z, Tian J, Liao H (2014) Comparative characterization of GmSPX members reveals that GmSPX3 is involved in phosphate homeostasis in soybean. *Ann Bot* 114:477–488
- Yoshida S, Cui S, Ichihashi Y, Shirasu K (2016) The Haustorium, a specialized invasive organ in parasitic plants. *Annu Rev Plant Biol* 67:643–667
- Zhou Z, Tan H, Li Q et al (2018) CRISPR/Cas9-mediated efficient targeted mutagenesis of RAS in *Salvia miltiorrhiza*. *Phytochem* 148:63–70